## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

DEBORA NOVAKOWSKI, Civil Action No. 04-356E

Plaintiff, Judge Sean J. McLaughlin

**Electronically Filed** 

v.

ELAINE CHAO, SECRETARY OF LABOR, and the UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR,

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

Defendants.

#### PLAINTIFF'S PROPOSED SUPPLEMENTAL JURY INSTRUCTIONS

AND NOW, comes the Plaintiff to the above-captioned action, by and through her undersigned attorney, and respectfully submit the following Proposed Supplemental Jury Instructions.

#### 1. Proposed Supplemental Jury Instruction

### **Burden-Shifting**

If the Plaintiff establishes the elements of a prima facie case, the employer must articulate a legitimate, non-discriminatory reason for its employment decision. Once such a justification is proffered, the burden then reverts to the Plaintiff to prove by a preponderance of the evidence that the articulated reason is a pretext. At all times, the Plaintiff bears the ultimate burden of proving that discrimination was a determinative factor in the adverse employment decision. The Plaintiff may succeed in this either directly by persuading you that a discriminatory reason more likely motivated the employer or indirectly by showing that the employer's proffered explanation is unworthy of credence.

If you find that the employer's proffered justification for its actions is pretextual, you are permitted, albeit not mandated, to return a verdict in the Plaintiff's favor. <u>Texas Dep't of Community Affairs v. Burdine</u>, 450 U.S. 248, 256, 67 L.Ed. 2d 207, 101 S.Ct. 1089 (1981). St. Mary's Honor Ctr. v. Hicks, 509 U.S. 502, 125 L.Ed. 2d 407 113 S.Ct. 2742 (1993).

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: June 7, 2006 s/ John R. Linkosky

Attorney for Plaintiff
John R. Linkosky, Esquire
Pa. I.D. No. 66011

JOHN LINKOSKY & ASSOC. 715 Washington Avenue Carnegie, PA 15106 412 278-1280 412 278-1282 (Fax)

Counsel for Plaintiff Debora Novakowski

# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

DEBORA C. NOVAKOWSKI, Plaintiff,

Civil Action No. 04-356E

v.

Judge Sean J. McLaughlin **Electronically Filed** 

ELAINE CHAO, SECRETARY, and the UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR,

Defendants.

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that the original of the foregoing Plaintiff's Proposed Supplemental Jury

Instructions has been *electronically filed* this 7th day of June, 2006.

Paul E. Skirtich, Esquire Assistant U.S. Attorney United States Department of Justice U.S. Post Office & Courthouse 700 Grant Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15219

s/ John R. Linkosky
John R. Linkosky, Esquire
Attorney for Plaintiff